The 9th Jerusalem Conference on the Digitisation of Cultural Heritage

Agora. Scholarly Open Access in Philosophy: a model for open research in the humanities with advanced scholarly semantic linking

Cristina Marras
Institute for the Intellectual Lexicon and History of Ideas
Italian National Research Council (ILIESI-CNR), Rome
1. Overview
2. Rationale
3. Content
4. The experiments (tools and procedures)
5. Problems
AGORA AT GLANCE

AGORA

Scholarly Open Access Research in European Philosophy

• Financed by: European Commission


• Agora – 270904 - Pilot project type B – Digital Libraries

• Duration: 1 January 2011 - 31 December 2013 = 36 months

• 1.799.890 ml. €
The consortium

ITALY: Istituto per il Lessico Intellettuale Europeo e Storia delle Idee – Consiglio Nazionale delle Ricerche - CNR-ILIESI (Coordinator)

FRANCE: Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique - CNR

NORWAY: University of Bergen

ITALY: Net7

DENMARK: University of Copenhagen

FINLAND: Åbo Akademi University

From 1/1/2011 to 6/30/2012

AUSTRIA: University of Vienna (coordinator)

ENGLAND: University of Oxford

GERMANY: ONTO Publishing House (from 30/6/2012 subcontract)
Agora at glance

WP1 – Project Management, sustainability and dissemination (coord. ILIESI)
WP2 – User outreach, evaluation (Univ. Copenhagen)
WP3 – Software customization and LOD experiment (Net7)
WP4 – Content preparation and publication (Univ. Bergen)
WP5 – Scholarly interlinking and rendering experiment (CNRS)
WP6 – Open peer review experiment (ILIESI-CNR)
WP7 – PPP OA business models experiment (Åbo Akademi University)
Agora Strengths

Improves the spread of European research results in the field of philosophy.

Advances new paradigms of:

- Open Access publishing
- Peer review
- Rendering by interlinking current scientific information (scholarly research output) among each other and its underlying datasets (digital reproductions of primary sources and text editions)
[T]wo things would be necessary for men to be able to benefit from their advantages and to do all they can in order to contribute to their own happiness, at least as far as knowledge is concerned [...] [F]irst, a precise inventory of all the available but dispersed and ill-ordered pieces of knowledge [...] secondly, the general science that must provide not only the means for making use of the available knowledge, but also the Method of judging and discovering, in order to go farther [...]

(G. W. Leibniz, Nouvelles ouvertures, 1686)
OPEN

building on existing OA resources, extending OA resources to secondary literature and creating new OA resources exploring different ways of enhancing these resources through a series of experiments.

(Re)Usable

Searchable

RE-searchable

USERS

Social

Eva/Minerva Conference
Jerusalem 13-14, November 2012
Extensive multilingual collection of scholarly editions extending semantic digital libraries

Philospace

Multimedia Encyclopedia of Philosophy

PreSocratics

Socrates et Socraticorum reliquia

Ancient Philosophy

Wittgenstein

Philospace

Philospace

Philospace

Philospace

Philospace

Philospace

Philospace

Philospace

Nietzsche

Modern Philosophy

Diogenes Laërtius

RDF
DAPNET PORTAL

**Ancient Source:** Presocratic; Socratis et Socraticorum Reliquiae; Laertius's Lives of Philosophers; complete works of Sextus Empiricus.

**Modern Source:** Baumgarten, Bruno, Descartes, Kant, Leibniz, Locke, Spinoza, and Vico.

**Daphnet Digital Library:** critical contributions focusing on the texts of Daphnet portal.

**Nietzsche Source:** Complete Works; Posthumous fragments; facsimile of the manuscripts of the Weimar Nietzsche Estate + complete reference edition of Nietzsche’s Letters

**J.J. Rousseau** important collection of manuscripts reproduced in high resolution facsimile edition.

**Wittgenstein Source:** primary sources, Bergen Facsimile Edition (BFE), Bergen Text Edition (BTE) of 5000 pages of Wittgenstein's Nachlass.
Two new online int. journals (OA)

**LEXICON PHILOSOPHICUM**
International Journal for the History of Texts and Ideas

**NORDIC WITTGENSTEIN REVIEW**

Studia Nietzschiana - first issue in 2013
Es. the path: from paper to digital
### 5 Experiments

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Experiment number</th>
<th>Mode of enhancement of digital publication</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Experiment 1</td>
<td>Semantic linking between and among primary and secondary sources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experiment 2</td>
<td>Linked Open Data models for philosophical resources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experiment 3</td>
<td>Bidirectional links in order to provide a different mode of access to citations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experiment 4</td>
<td>Open collaborative review of philosophical scholarship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experiment 5</td>
<td>Business models for Open Access publishing</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Set out the requirements for the evaluation of the five experiments + monitoring
Experiments 1 / 2 / 3
Primary and primary; primary and secondary sources

- semantic linking
- tag xml for additional datasets
- defined unambiguous URL
* Open Source Software (OSS)
The nodes of the federation uses **Open Journal System**

**The Agora LOD Portal** is a web application based on the API of a new tool of the **MURUCA** platform called **KORBO** [http://korbo.muruca.org/](http://korbo.muruca.org/)

The Federation Portal aggregates structured metadata from the federation nodes and make it available in a variety of formats -LOD RDF, OAI-PMH, RSS- to ensure interoperability with third party service providers (Europeana, DOAJ, OAIster and Philpapersorg)

**PUNDIT** enables semantically structured annotations [http://thepund.it/](http://thepund.it/)
Korbo aims at providing a coherent environment for users to aggregate semantically structured description of digital objects (in the form of RDF data), coming from different metadata providers, into personal baskets and to enable augmentation of such collected data relying on external, specific tools.

* Figures and the text in this slide are from: http://korbo.muruca.org
** Pundit enables users to create structured data annotating web pages

Collect annotations in notebooks

Share with others to create collaborative structured knowledge. From simple comments to semantic links to the Web of Data (as Freebase.com and Dbpedia.org), to fine granular cross-references and citations

Pundit can include custom controlled vocabularies

** See Pundit in: http://thepund.it
— 220 —

Sit a quantitas data constans, crit da aequalis 0, et dax eart aequalis adv. Si sit y aequ. v (seu ordinata quaevis curvae YY aequalis cuivis ordinatae respondenti curvae VV) crit dy aequ. dv.

Jam Additio et Subtractio: si sit z - y + w + x aequ. v, crit
dz - y + w + x seu dv aequ. dz - dy + dw +dx.

Multiplicatio: dxv aequ. xdv + vdx, seu positio y aequ. xv, fiet dy aequ. vdx + vdx.

In arbitrio enim est vel formulam, ut xv, vel compendio pro ea litteram, ut y, adhibere. Notandum, et x et dx eodem modo in hoc calculo tractari, ut y et dy, vel aliam litteram indeterminatam cum sua differentiali. Notandum etiam, non dari
Sit a quantitas data constans, erit da aequalis 0, et dax erit aequalis ddx. Si sit y acqu. v (seu ordinata quavis curvae YY aequalis cuvis ordinatae respondenti curvae VV) erit dy aequ. dv. Jam Additio et Subtractio: si sit z = y + w + x aequ. v, erit dz = dy + dw + dx. Multiplio et dividio: dxx aequ. dxd + dx, seu positio y aequ. xv, fict dy aequ. xdv + vdx. In arbitrio enim est vel formulam, ut xv, vel compendio pro ea literam, ut y, adhibere. Notandum et x et dx equal modo in hoc calculo tractari, ut y et dy, vel aliam literam indeterminatam cum sua differentiali. Notandum etiam, non semper regressum a differentialibus: A differentialis Aequatione, nisi cum qualibet cautio, de quo alibi.

Porro Division: d(y/v) vel (posito z aequ. v'y) dz aequ. v'ydv = v'dv + v dy. Queda Signa hoc probe notandum, cum in calculo pro litera substitutor simpliciter ejus differentiales, servari obligatory eadem signa, et pro + scribi + dz, pro - z scribi - dz, ut sane.

Et substractione paulo ante posta apparit; sed quando ad excescin valorem venitur, seu cum consideratur ipsius z relatio ad x, tunc apparece, an valor ipsi dz sit quantitas affirmativa, an nihil minor seu negativa: quot posterior cum fit, tunc tangens ZE ducitur a puncto Z non versus A, sed in partes contrarias seu infra X, id est tunc cum ipsae ordinatae z decrescent crescuntibus x. Et quia ipsae ordinatae v modo crescent, modo decrescent, erit dv modo affirmativa, modo negativa quantitas, et priore casi, V_1B tangens ducitur versus A, posteriorie V_2B in partes aversas: neutum autem fit in medio circa M, quo momento ipsae v neque crescunt neque decrescent, sed in statu sunt, ad coequo fit dv aequ. 0, ubi nihil refert, quantitas sitne affirmativa an negativa, nam + 0 aequ. - 0: eoque in loco ipsa v, nempe ordinata LM, est Maxima (vel si convexitatem Axi obverteret, Minima) et tangens curvae in M neque supra X ducitur ad partes A, ibique axi propinquit, neque infra X ad partes contrarias, sed est axi parallela. Si dv sit ininita respectu ipsius dx, tunc tangens est ad axem recta, seu est ipsa ordinata. Si dv et dx aequales, tangens facit angulum semirectum ad axem. Si crescentibus ordinatis...
Sit a quantitas data constans, erit d...

sit a quantitas data constans, erit da equallis 0, et dax erit equallis adx. si sit y acqu. v (seu ordinata quaevis curvae YY equallis cuvis ordinatae respondenti curvae VV) erit dy acqu. dv. jam additio et subtractio: si sit z = y + w + x aequ. v, erit dz = dy + dw +dx. multiplicatio: dxx acqu. xdv + vdx, seu posty y acqu. xv, fiet dy acqu. xdv + vdx. in artificio enim est vei formulam, ut xv, vei compendio pro ea literam, ut adhæribus. notandum, et e x et dx eodemmodo in hac calculo trahitur, ut y et dx, vel in aliam literam indeterminatam cum suo differentiali. notandum etiam, non daret semper regressum a differentiis. aequatione, nisi cum quadratum couctionum, de quo alibi. porro division: div(dv/y) vel (posto y acqu. v) dz acqu.(xvy+dyv)/y.

Quad Signa hoc probe notandum,

Types:
- Page fragment

More info:
- Cum in calculo pro litera substituitur simpliciter ejus differentiales, servari quidem eadem signa, et pro + z scribi + dz, pro - z scribi - dz, ut ex additione.

---

et substractione paulo ante positæ apparet; sed quando ad sequesin valorum venitur, seu cum consideratur ipsius z relatio ad x, tunc apparet, an valor ipsius dz sit quantias affirmativa, an nihil minor seu negativa: quod posterius cum fit, tunc tangens ZE ductur a puncto Z non versus A, sed in partes contrarias seu infra X, id est tunc cum ipsæ ordinatae decrecent crescibus x. Et quia ipsæ ordinatae vmodo crescent, modo decrecent, erit dv modo affirmativa, modo negativa quantias, et priore
Create semantically structured data

Annotate

Enrich the Web of Data

Express semantically typed relations among resources

Rely on ontologies and specific vocabularies (multilingual thesauri)

Share your notebook

This page is from Pundit, see: http://thepund.it
Open Peer Review

Open Peer Review Process: 4 STEPS

• 1. General **eligibility** and quality **check** by the editors. The editorial procedures is designed to follow best practices concerning excellence, impartiality, transparency, purposefulness, efficiency, confidentiality and integrity.

• 2. **Double-blind** peer review. The identity of the reviewers and the authors is kept confidential from each other.

• 3. One-month of **open peer-review**.
- Registered users of the journal are enabled to comment on and to discuss the selected and peer reviewed papers.
- Authors are able to use these comments and discussions to revise their final submission for publication.

* 4: **Ex-post** review
Open Peer Review

The Agora Open Collaborative Peer Review Experiment is one of the answers to some of the questions emerging in the international debate concerning peer review and research evaluation and to the need to integrate policies and practices into coherent procedures*.

Looking forward:

Problems and Horizons
AGORA is contributing to: Data interoperability and reuse

- **Opening** wider access to more scientific information (*in* and *ex*)

- **Improving** ways to review, render, query and link scientific information

- **Setting up** data journals and initiatives that improve the quality and trustworthiness of repositories

- **Developing** effective: a. interdisciplinary **COLLABORATION** (*in* and *ex*), b. collaboration between different stakeholders
Thesauri

The creation of a vocabulary is particularly problematic.

The concepts are affected by:

- a considerable large temporal interval between documents (i.e. ancient philosophy, from VI b.C. to IX a.C.; modern philosophy, from Renaissance to Enlightenment...)
- a relevant dishomogeneity
- the various interpretations of the secondary literature.
Multilingualism

- to preserve the richness of nuances of meanings of each philosophical concept *vis à vis* its formalization

- to represent the specific meaning assumed by a concept in relation to the *époque* and the context in which it has been used

- to have an adequate representation of knowledge since the platforms are not dealing with a single author and its works, but with authors belonging to different times and with writings written in different languages
Open Key issues (in Humanities)

- From establish to share standards
- Share practices
- Work on cultural change towards “evaluation” (a dialectic and critical evaluation)

- Render open access publications “more valuable” and broader accepted
- Strategies for “trust”
- Became social & credible
- Change in tools and modalities of communication
Institute for the Intellectual European Lexicon and History of Ideas:  http://www.iliesi.cnr.it